

# Investigating the Effects of Popularity on Comment Civility: A YouTube Case Study

Department of Visual Art and Design | J.N. Andrews Honors Program  
Isaac Smith & Dr. Heather Day

# Inspiration

- Personal Observation / History with YouTube

Stats

---

Joined Nov 17, 2009

---

9,630 views

---



# The Law of Big Numbers

- Dhiraj and Sanjay describe the difficulty of online moderation.
- Random sampling, 400 comments out of 23,000.

SHOW MORE

Should be pretty easy.

35 Comments



SORT BY



Add a public comment...



**megasoniczxx** 2 months ago

I like how spidey's web shooters sort of work like da

Comparison Video

- Evaluation Factors to express civility numerically / Youtube Comment Scraper

(Han et al)

**Table I.** Percentages of Use in Open-Ended Responses, by Experimental Condition.

	Civil (n=90)	Uncivil (n=114)	Meta (n=117)	Total (n=321)
Level of civility				
Uncivil	3.3	4.4	6.8	5.0
Polite	73.3	86.8	86.3	82.9
Civil	23.3	8.8	6.8	12.1
Relevance				
Relevant	91.1	79.8	73.5	80.7
Not relevant	8.9	20.2	26.5	19.3
Additional perspectives				
Offered	43.3	25.4	32.5	33.0
Not offered	56.7	74.6	67.5	67.0
Meta-communication				
Present	2.2	10.5	18.8	11.2
Not present	97.8	89.5	81.2	88.8

(Dhiraj and Sanjay)

**Table I.** Coding schema.

Parent code	Child code	Sub-code	Description	Code
None			Post removed/spam	0
Non-inflammatory	Constructive		Either informative or adds to dialogue	1
		General	Other type of general comment/reply	2
	Anti-racist		Anti-racist comment non-inflammatory	3
Inflammatory	Non-racialized	homophobic	Hostile homosexual terms	4
		misogyny	Hostile female terms	5
		other	Other kinds of non-racial hostility and slurs	6
	Racialized	hostility	Ad hominem attacks, threats	7
		overt	Racial slurs, name calling, stereotyping	8
		anti-racist	Opposes anti-black/minority racism via inflammatory racialized expressions	9
	Sarcasm	Sarcasm or trolling (as difficult to distinguish)	10	

# Prof. Bailey's Advice

- Statistical evaluation through replicable results.
- LIWC (Linguistic Inquiry and **W**ord **C**ount)
- Youtube Comment Scraper > LIWC > Jamovi




YCS/Jamovi Video

Source (A)	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N
Source (A)	Source (B)	Source (C)	WC	Analytic	Clout	Authentic	Tone	WPS	Sixtr	Dic	function	pronoun	ppron
ALLTEXT	Emojis	Spelling Errors	1	92.84	50.00	1.00	25.77	1.00	100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
My favorite Spiderman character is Spiderman noir. I do love all spiders but I relate to his attitude in a way	1		21	54.14	31.71	89.63	99.00	10.50	28.57	71.43	47.62	19.05	19.05
I have been on your channel when you had 10k		1, 'haved'	10	1.00	99.00	93.30	25.77	10.00	10.00	90.00	80.00	30.00	30.00
I subscribed to your channel when I was in middle school which I'm graduated now but saints row 3 walkthroughs was where it began			24	1.80	20.24	99.00	25.77	24.00	16.67	83.33	58.33	25.00	16.67
Come on fanboys show me what you've got			8	11.24	89.42	99.00	25.77	8.00	12.50	87.50	50.00	37.50	25.00
I started 4 years ago assassin creed black flag . My favorite Spider-Man character is miles morales			17	58.07	27.83	99.00	98.87	8.50	29.41	64.71	17.65	11.76	11.76
I found your channel in early 2013			7	67.14	92.33	99.00	25.77	7.00	14.29	85.71	42.86	28.57	28.57
This game looks terrible, I don't see how the ps4 is considered a graphical improvement over the ps3. I'm on PC now and there you can see improvement, that being said good video bro thanks f			37	32.06	79.13	21.26	99.00	18.50	16.22	100.00	51.35	13.51	8.11
And x legacy will live so shut the fuck up for real		1, 'stfu'	13	82.00	6.21	17.46	1.00	13.00	0.00	76.92	46.15	0.00	0.00
o			1	92.84	50.00	1.00	25.77	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
I liked man!Your my favorite gaming youtuber also.		1, 'fav'	9	1.00	86.68	58.07	99.00	9.00	33.33	88.89	44.44	33.33	33.33
I'm here from halo 4		1, 'halo4'	5	8.19	2.31	43.37	25.77	5.00	0.00	60.00	60.00	20.00	20.00
I've only been subscribed recently and I reckon you have been my best investment in you tube for a while hahaha, never a boring game play and i appreciate you for that. My favouri		1, 'whhhuut'	58	35.07	50.00	47.93	97.32	29.00	17.24	86.21	62.07	18.97	15.51
Congrats Brad your always my favorite			6	17.96	95.20	98.01	99.00	6.00	33.33	66.67	33.33	33.33	33.33
I've always liked Venom because he is a type that is dark creepy and likes to play with his prey			20	24.86	69.14	1.00	99.00	20.00	5.00	85.00	55.00	20.00	15.00
I have Xbox and PlayStation I'm getting SpiderMan this Thursday			10	1.00	2.31	93.30	25.77	10.00	40.00	90.00	50.00	30.00	20.00
I found you when gta 5 first released and found you again watching god of war my favorite character is venom			21	10.46	82.96	98.01	25.77	21.00	19.05	76.19	42.86	19.05	19.05
2012 venom			2	92.84	50.00	1.00	25.77	2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Did anyone else like the amazing Spider-Man game? The 1st one? I did and I hope it comes to PS4			21	67.14	50.00	13.15	99.00	7.00	4.76	90.48	52.38	19.05	9.51
Why so much hype about this game. It's average.			9	1.00	86.68	1.00	25.77	4.50	11.11	88.89	55.56	22.22	0.00
Venom			1	92.84	50.00	1.00	25.77	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
wow this my first time watching you in a couple years and i started watching you back in 2013 and i think its awesome that you continue to upload walkthrough videos		1, 'walck throug	31	35.22	83.34	99.00	99.00	31.00	19.35	90.32	51.61	29.03	19.31
Reminds me of Batman Arkham city			6	92.84	4.80	98.01	25.77	6.00	16.67	50.00	33.33	16.67	16.67
My favourite is venom			4	1.80	1.00	74.76	99.00	4.00	25.00	75.00	50.00	25.00	25.00
Been watching when you was playing saints row		1, 'u'	8	1.00	99.00	7.84	99.00	8.00	25.00	87.50	50.00	12.50	12.50
Started Watching our channel with dead space! Carnage is also my favorite. PS4		1, 'deadspace'	13	23.17	77.92	63.54	99.00	4.33	38.46	92.31	38.46	15.38	15.38
I found your channel through YouTube by randomly searching stuff my favorite Spider-Man character is miles morales			18	60.80	71.09	58.07	98.27	18.00	44.44	83.33	38.89	22.22	16.67
Batman			1	92.84	50.00	1.00	25.77	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
found your channel about when you played assassins creed syndicate. my favorite character is obviously peter parker.		1, 'obv'	17	14.53	96.11	28.81	99.00	8.50	35.29	70.59	35.29	17.65	17.65
Wow, this game looks great, that's some serious likes!!! (Especially for Part 1)			13	42.69	77.92	1.00	99.00	6.50	15.38	92.31	30.77	15.38	0.00
Been on the ride since Dead Rising 2 brother, keep it going			12	98.02	79.76	99.00	25.77	12.00	8.33	91.67	41.67	8.33	0.00
jheeze that is sick, gonna wait till like December, because buying games for £50 is not my thing lol. green goblin is probably the best character in spiderman		1, 'cos'	28	57.49	23.75	74.76	87.20	14.00	17.86	82.14	50.00	10.71	3.51
I started following you when you was playing last of us love your game plays		2, 'following/u'	15	3.09	99.00	98.01	99.00	15.00	20.00	100.00	53.33	33.33	33.33
I'd love to win!! I'm a huge gamer! Super man is one of my favorite hero's! Brad I love how consistent you are with uploading, you deserve more subscribers for all the work you put into your videos			47	53.86	97.20	25.35	99.00	7.83	10.64	82.98	44.68	19.15	19.15
How do we get a copy of the game?			9	74.89	99.00	1.00	25.77	9.00	0.00	88.89	66.67	11.11	11.11
I know it's too late for the give away, but my favorite Spiderman character is the JJJ from the Tobey McGuire movies			22	87.28	18.16	85.21	94.75	22.00	18.18	77.27	54.55	13.64	9.09



# The Race for First

407	Joshua Palmares youre actually first. Congrats
408	1st one to like
409	looks good
410	Hiiii!!! Love this game!!!!!!
411	Tom holland
412	First
413	Nice
414	Second 
415	First
416	Early Squad
417	mohamed wessam nope your 2nd I'm first
418	FIRST
419	:v

- Ironically, none of them were actually first.

# Writing and Syntax

- Interesting spelling choices ('vanom', 'venum', 'Carneg')
- Usage of Emojis as punctuation???
- Possibility of ESL writers from other countries. (Morocco, ect)

# Examples of Discourse

28	Ismael Abdelbas	I miss dsp	TRUE	3		I miss <u>dsp</u>	0
29					Caimdragonslap	Go suck his  then	1
30					god jajg	atCaimdragonslap The revengeance Chill caim, he is probably joking	0
31					KlassicKrusty	shudders	0

- Note how 'god jajg' responded to defuse the situation.

## Independent Samples T-Test

		statistic	df	p	Mean difference	Cohen's d
anger	Welch's t	-1.705	33.7	0.097	-1.443	-0.3097
<u>Tone</u>	Welch's t	2.591	33.2	<u>0.014</u>	<u>18.770</u>	<u>0.4924</u>
Clout	Welch's t	1.371	33.3	0.180	8.721	0.2602
Analytic	Welch's t	-1.188	33.0	0.243	-8.280	-0.2305
<u>Authentic</u>	Welch's t	3.231	34.3	<u>0.003</u>	<u>22.586</u>	<u>0.5601</u>
posemo	Welch's t	1.201	37.2	0.237	2.029	0.1740
WC	Welch's t	-1.248	30.7	0.221	-4.547	-0.3452
WPS	Welch's t	0.521	35.0	0.606	0.792	0.0856
Sixltr	Welch's t	-0.783	30.8	0.440	-3.704	-0.2119

# Conclusions

- Overall results were inconclusive.
- Context is vital for LIWC and manual analysis.
- If I continued this research, I'd obtain a larger sample size and focus on comments that received replies, generating observable discussion.
- Another exciting possibility is the creation of a custom LIWC library.

# Acknowledgements

To Dr. Heather Day, for being a guiding voice of reason as advisor.

To Dr. Bailey, for suggesting LIWC and Jamovi, and providing extensive support and guidance with the software.

To Philip Klostermann for developing YCS, which made my efforts much easier.

To Pennebaker et al. for developing LIWC, for the same reasons.

And the Jamovi team for... developing Jamovi.

# References

- Walsh, B. M., Magley, V. J., Davies-Schriels, K. A. Marmet, M. D., Reeves, D. A., & Gallus, J. A. Assessing work group norms for civility: Development of the Civility Norms Questionnaire – Brief. *Journal of Business and Psychology*. **2012**, *27*, 407-420.
- Reader, B. Free Press vs. Free Speech? The Rhetoric of “Civility” in Regard to Anonymous Online Comments. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*. **2012**, Vol 89, Issue 3, pp. 495 - 513.
- Soo-Hye Han, LeAnn M. Brazeal, and Natalie Pennington. Is Civility Contagious? Examining the Impact of Modeling in Online Political Discussions. *Social Media + Society*. **2018**.
- Dhiraj, M.; Sanjay, S. Visualizing YouTube’s comment space: online hostility as a networked phenomena. *New Media & Society*. **2018**.
- Pennebaker, J.W., Boyd, R.L., Jordan, K., & Blackburn, K. (2015). The development and psychometric properties of LIWC2015. Austin, TX: University of Texas at Austin. DOI: 10.15781/T29G6Z

# Questions